## EQUITY PRICES ARE MORE VOLATILE THAN THEIR FUNDAMENTALS

Jeremy Schwartz - Global Chief Investment Officer 08/01/2013

WisdomTree recently introduced the Emerging Markets Dividend Growth Index (WTEMDG) at a time when emerging market equities have been disappointing-performers lagging many of the other global equity markets regions<sup>1</sup>. In this blog, I provide some analysis on how much of the volatility in emerging market equity prices is tied to changes in the emerging market fundamentals, and I take a look at history to illustrate the relationship between volatility in the dividends and prices of emerging market equities. Noisy Equity Prices One reason WisdomTree believes a rules-based rebalancing program adds value is that equity prices contain an element of noise-equity prices often fluctuate more than the <u>fundamental fair values</u> . To illustrate how equity volatility is higher than fundamentals, we compare the average annual volatility of equity prices to the average annual volatility of dividends. Whether one looks at the MSCI Emerging Markets Index (EM Equities) or the <u>S&P 500 Index</u> (U.S. Equities), the average annual volatility indicates that prices exhibit greater movements (both positive and negative) around their average level than do dividends. This is one indication that equity markets tend to overreact to changes in dividend levels, and we believe this creates the opportunity to rebalance a portfolio back to these fundamental metrics. EM Equities vs. Dividend Behavior U.S. Equities-Price vs. (6/30/1993-6/30/2013)

		Average Annual Growth			Average Annual Stdandard Deviation	
Period	Equity Region	Price	Dividends <sup>1</sup>	Price-to- Dividend Multiple <sup>2</sup>	Price	Dividends <sup>1</sup>
20-Year	EM Equities	5.0%	7.5%	-2.3%	22.6%	16.7%
	U.S. Equities	6.7%	5.0%	1.6%	16.4%	8.3%
10-Year	<b>EM Equities</b>	10.9%	13.4%	-2.2%	23.8%	19.3%
	U.S. Equities	5.2%	7.5%	-2.2%	16.9%	11.1%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Dividends: Refers to trailing 12-month dividends, which aggregate dividends paid over a prior 12-month period.

Dividends Are Volatile Yet emerging market dividends behave differently than dividends from those in the United States. The dividend volatility over 20 years was twice as high for EM Equities as it was for U.S. Equities<sup>2</sup>. There is a different mentality in the United States than in the emerging markets when it comes to dividend policies. U.S. companies do not like to raise and lower their dividends; they often manage cash to maintain a certain dividend per share every quarter. By contrast, emerging market dividend growth often mirrors the behavior of earnings. We think the volatility of these dividends in EM Equities helps motivate our new dividend growth Index to focus on stocks that rank highly on our proprietary quality and growth selection factors. We believe that our stock selection factors can potentially help manage the volatility that we see in emerging market <u>Dividend Streams</u>. The Link between Dividend Growth and Return: Valuation While their dividend growth has disappointed recently, the emerging markets



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Price-to-dividend multiple: Refers to the index price divided by the trailing 12-month dividends. Sources: Bloomberg, MSCI

still possess some of the best prospects for economic growth over the long term. When investors get overly enthused about growth prospects, there is a tendency to overpay for this potential growth. From this perspective, it is interesting to contrast how the price-to-dividend multiple has changed with respect to U.S. Equities and EM Equities over the last 10 and 20 years<sup>3</sup>. Over the last 20 years U.S. Equities have seen trailing 12-month dividend growth of 5.0% and price appreciation of 6.7% per year<sup>4</sup>. This increase in price level was fueled by an expansion of 1.6% per year in the price-to-dividend ratio-or a valuation multiple of the market that measures the relationship between the index price level and the index's trailing 12-month dividends. In the emerging markets, the price-to-dividend ratios have contracted over the last 20 years, as price growth lagged dividend growth by more than 2.2% per year over the period. These contracting valuation multiples (dividends becoming less expensive relative to prices) for the emerging markets are one reason why I believe that these stocks are attractive from their current valuation perspective. Combining a Focus on Dividend Growth Stocks with Relative Value Rebalancing WisdomTree believes that a focus on growth-oriented companies must be married with a disciplined focus on valuations, and when we consider dividend growth potential as a component of index methodology, we marry it with a sensitivity to valuation. Specifically, WisdomTree uses a rules-based rebalancing program that involves tying Index constituent weights back to the Dividend Stream to focus on valuations-as it does in all its dividend-based Indexes. While many dividendfocused indexes in emerging markets focus on yield and valuation, there is a dearth of options that focus on dividend growth. We believe that the WTEMDG approach with its flexibility to respond to growth represents the future of dividend growth indexing.

Unless otherwise stated, data source is WisdomTree.  $^{1}$ Refers to the MSCI Emerging Markets Index performance over the period 6/30/2010 to 6/30/2013, which has lagged that of the MSCI EAFE Index and the S&P 500 Index.  $^{2}$ Source: Bloomberg, MSCI, 6/30/1993-6/30/2013  $^{3}$ Source: Bloomberg, MSCI, 6/30/1993-6/30/2013  $^{4}$ Source: Bloomberg, MSCI, 6/30/1993-6/30/2013

## Important Risks Related to this Article

Dividends are not guaranteed and a company's future abilities to pay dividends may be limited. A company currently paying dividends may cease paying dividends at any time. You cannot invest directly in an index.

For standardized performance and the most recent month-end performance click <a href="here">here</a> NOTE, this material is intended for electronic use only. Individuals who intend to print and physically deliver to an investor must print the monthly performance report to accompany this blog.

For more investing insights, check out our <a>Economic & Market Outlook</a>

View the online version of this article here.



## **IMPORTANT INFORMATION**

U.S. investors only: Click <u>here</u> to obtain a WisdomTree ETF prospectus which contains investment objectives, risks, charges, expenses, and other information; read and consider carefully before investing.

There are risks involved with investing, including possible loss of principal. Foreign investing involves currency, political and economic risk. Funds focusing on a single country, sector and/or funds that emphasize investments in smaller companies may experience greater price volatility. Investments in emerging markets, currency, fixed income and alternative investments include additional risks. Please see prospectus for discussion of risks.

Past performance is not indicative of future results. This material contains the opinions of the author, which are subject to change, and should not to be considered or interpreted as a recommendation to participate in any particular trading strategy, or deemed to be an offer or sale of any investment product and it should not be relied on as such. There is no guarantee that any strategies discussed will work under all market conditions. This material represents an assessment of the market environment at a specific time and is not intended to be a forecast of future events or a guarantee of future results. This material should not be relied upon as research or investment advice regarding any security in particular. The user of this information assumes the entire risk of any use made of the information provided herein. Neither WisdomTree nor its affiliates, nor Foreside Fund Services, LLC, or its affiliates provide tax or legal advice. Investors seeking tax or legal advice should consult their tax or legal advisor. Unless expressly stated otherwise the opinions, interpretations or findings expressed herein do not necessarily represent the views of WisdomTree or any of its affiliates.

The MSCI information may only be used for your internal use, may not be reproduced or re-disseminated in any form and may not be used as a basis for or component of any financial instruments or products or indexes. None of the MSCI information is intended to constitute investment advice or a recommendation to make (or refrain from making) any kind of investment decision and may not be relied on as such. Historical data and analysis should not be taken as an indication or guarantee of any future performance analysis, forecast or prediction. The MSCI information is provided on an "as is" basis and the user of this information assumes the entire risk of any use made of this information. MSCI, each of its affiliates and each entity involved in compiling, computing or creating any MSCI information (collectively, the "MSCI Parties") expressly disclaims all warranties. With respect to this information, in no event shall any MSCI Party have any liability for any direct, indirect, special, incidental, punitive, consequential (including loss profits) or any other damages (www.msci.com)

Jonathan Steinberg, Jeremy Schwartz, Rick Harper, Christopher Gannatti, Bradley Krom, Tripp Zimmerman, Michael Barrer, Anita Rausch, Kevin Flanagan, Brendan Loftus, Joseph Tenaglia, Jeff Weniger, Matt Wagner, Alejandro Saltiel, Ryan Krystopowicz, Jianing Wu, and Brian Manby are registered representatives of Foreside Fund Services, LLC.

WisdomTree Funds are distributed by Foreside Fund Services, LLC, in the U.S. only. You cannot invest directly in an index.



## **DEFINITIONS**

<u>Volatility</u>: A measure of the dispersion of actual returns around a particular average level.&nbsp.

<u>Fundamental fair value</u>: What the share price of a firm would be if the sole determinant were the behavior of the underlying fundamental factor, an example of which would be the dividend per share.

MSCI Emerging Markets Index: a broad market cap-weighted Index showing performance of equities across 23 emerging market countries defined as "emerging markets" by MSCI.

<u>S&P 500 Index</u>: Market capitalization-weighted benchmark of 500 stocks selected by the Standard and Poor's Index Committee designed to represent the performance of the leading industries in the United States economy.

**Quality**: Characterized by higher efficiency and profitability. Typical measures include earnings, return on equity, return on assets, operating profitability as well as others. This term is also related to the Quality Factor, which associates these stock characteristics with excess returns vs the market over tim.

<u>Growth</u>: Characterized by higher price levels relative to fundamentals, such as dividends or earnings. Price levels are higher because investors are willing to pay more due to their expectations of future improvements in these fundamentals.

**Dividend Stream**: Refers to the regular dividends per share multiplied by the number of shares outstanding.

