SHILLER, SIEGEL AND GREENWOOD DISCUSS VALUATIONS, BUBBLES AND MORE

Jeremy Schwartz - Global Chief Investment Officer 09/18/2018

On last week's "Behind the Markets" podcast, we had a special edition that was broadcast live from the annual conference held by the Wharton Jacobs Levy Equity Management Center for Quantitative Financial Research in New York City. Our guests included Nobel Prize winner Robert Shiller, Harvard Business School professor Robin Greenwood, and Wharton professor Jeremy Siegel for the full hour.

Shiller and Siegel shared a stage at the conference to discuss research on cyclically adjusted <u>price-to-earnings (CAPE) ratios</u> and what they implied for forward market returns, and Greenwood discussed his research on bubbles both in general markets and the <u>high-yield</u> credit markets.

Shiller's work on <u>behavioral finance</u> examines all types of psychological influences that affect "animal spirits." Back before Trump was elected, when the market still looked at Trump as being a potential negative catalyst with associated rising levels of uncertainty, Shiller thought the markets would respond positively to Trump, and Siegel gave him credit for correctly calling that out ahead of time.

Shiller described how he started looking at the CAPE ratio back with his graduate student and now Harvard professor John Campbell. I asked Shiller to comment on Professor Siegel's observation that the CAPE ratio suggested the market was overvalued almost the entirety of the last 30-years-except for a brief window in 2009. Shiller answered that "one of the reasons value investing works is because it is hard and it could fail to work for longer periods of time than you'd ever think."

Siegel's expected returns are 5.5% for the next 10 years, whereas some regressions show returns of 2.6% in some of our calculations. Siegel said that with a <u>dividend yield</u> a little less than 2%, he's expecting real earnings growth of 3.5% to get to that longer-term estimate of 5.5% returns. We had a discussion about the total size of profit growth in the economy-which has to track <u>real GDP</u> and real corporate profits growth of 1% to 2%. But because companies are conducting corporate <u>buybacks</u>, a reduction in shares can increase <u>per-share earnings</u> growth ahead of the natural rate of growth in the economy.

Trust

We had an interesting conversation on the importance of global companies and the earnings coming from abroad and whether Trump's trade spats will lead to a boycott of U.S. goods overseas. Professor Siegel emphasized how important U.S. brands were for foreign consumers in a number of emerging markets and that they instilled a level of



trust that perhaps isn't there for some of even China's own brands. Shiller commented that he sees a lack of trust and growth of conspiracy theories—and with a lack of trust in the media, that does not portend future strong economic growth to him.

Bubbles

Some of Greenwood's recent research focuses on <u>bubbles</u>, and he thinks it is a taboo topic for academics—largely because it is easy to look in hindsight to identify bubbles but it is hard to do it ex ante (ahead of time). On this topic, Greenwood highlighted parallels between the speculative frenzy of the internet boom and currently what is happening surrounding the blockchain. Changing your name to include .com during the internet craze would help catapult a stock higher, and we're now seeing that with blockchain. There also is a lot of new issuance—from the internet.com and now initial currency offerings (ICOs), there is a lot of volume and a lot of media attention and the price action that was remarkably similar.

Credit Pricing and Tinderbox

Greenwood also has done some research on the credit markets and how credit issuance ties to future expected returns for high-yield bonds. One of the important indicators he follows is what percentage of all bond issuance is high credit quality bonds versus speculative-grade bonds. He also talked about how much issuance is happening in the BBB space—which is the lowest quality of bonds in the investment grade but not in the junk category. Greenwood calls this the tinderbox, and he wonders how close we are to the fire lighting—when we get a recession, there is a much higher BBB downgrade to the junk category.

Narrative Economics

Shiller gave a speech on narrative economics and how economists have avoided getting political when talking about narratives that drive people's decisions. The current narrative is focused on Donald Trump-Shiller thinks he has successfully captured the narrative, whether you like him or not. Shiller said narratives have always been driving markets-from the Roaring 1920s to the Great Depression to the Age of Communism, when people thought capitalism failed and there were many beggars on the street.

What are current narratives? Shiller described how one of the market narratives that has resurfaced is robots replacing jobs; while people don't remember it, he said this discussion also happened during the Great Depression.

You can listen to the full conversation below.

For standardized performance and the most recent month-end performance click <u>here</u> NOTE, this material is intended for electronic use only. Individuals who intend to print and physically deliver to an investor must print the monthly performance report to accompany



this blog.

For more investing insights, check out our <u>Economic & Market Outlook</u>

View the online version of this article here.



IMPORTANT INFORMATION

U.S. investors only: Click <u>here</u> to obtain a WisdomTree ETF prospectus which contains investment objectives, risks, charges, expenses, and other information; read and consider carefully before investing.

There are risks involved with investing, including possible loss of principal. Foreign investing involves currency, political and economic risk. Funds focusing on a single country, sector and/or funds that emphasize investments in smaller companies may experience greater price volatility. Investments in emerging markets, currency, fixed income and alternative investments include additional risks. Please see prospectus for discussion of risks.

Past performance is not indicative of future results. This material contains the opinions of the author, which are subject to change, and should not to be considered or interpreted as a recommendation to participate in any particular trading strategy, or deemed to be an offer or sale of any investment product and it should not be relied on as such. There is no guarantee that any strategies discussed will work under all market conditions. This material represents an assessment of the market environment at a specific time and is not intended to be a forecast of future events or a guarantee of future results. This material should not be relied upon as research or investment advice regarding any security in particular. The user of this information assumes the entire risk of any use made of the information provided herein. Neither WisdomTree nor its affiliates, nor Foreside Fund Services, LLC, or its affiliates provide tax or legal advice. Investors seeking tax or legal advice should consult their tax or legal advisor. Unless expressly stated otherwise the opinions, interpretations or findings expressed herein do not necessarily represent the views of WisdomTree or any of its affiliates.

The MSCI information may only be used for your internal use, may not be reproduced or re-disseminated in any form and may not be used as a basis for or component of any financial instruments or products or indexes. None of the MSCI information is intended to constitute investment advice or a recommendation to make (or refrain from making) any kind of investment decision and may not be relied on as such. Historical data and analysis should not be taken as an indication or guarantee of any future performance analysis, forecast or prediction. The MSCI information is provided on an "as is" basis and the user of this information assumes the entire risk of any use made of this information. MSCI, each of its affiliates and each entity involved in compiling, computing or creating any MSCI information (collectively, the "MSCI Parties") expressly disclaims all warranties. With respect to this information, in no event shall any MSCI Party have any liability for any direct, indirect, special, incidental, punitive, consequential (including loss profits) or any other damages (www.msci.com)

Jonathan Steinberg, Jeremy Schwartz, Rick Harper, Christopher Gannatti, Bradley Krom, Tripp Zimmerman, Michael Barrer, Anita Rausch, Kevin Flanagan, Brendan Loftus, Joseph Tenaglia, Jeff Weniger, Matt Wagner, Alejandro Saltiel, Ryan Krystopowicz, Jianing Wu, and Brian Manby are registered representatives of Foreside Fund Services, LLC.

WisdomTree Funds are distributed by Foreside Fund Services, LLC, in the U.S. only. You cannot invest directly in an index.



DEFINITIONS

<u>Price-to-earnings (P/E) ratio</u>: Share price divided by earnings per share. Lower numbers indicate an ability to access greater amounts of earnings per dollar invested.

<u>High Yield</u>: Sometimes referred to as "junk bonds," these securities have a higher risk of default than investment-grade securitie.

Behavioral finance: An academic branch of finance devoted to studying the behavior of individuals as it relates to their financial decisions.

<u>Dividend yield</u>: A financial ratio that shows how much a company pays out in dividends each year relative to its share price.

Real growth: Refers to the rate of economic growth with the inflation rate subtracted from it.

<u>Buyback</u>: When a company uses its own cash to purchase its own outstanding shares; may positively impact the share price.

Per share growth : refers to the amount of growth per shar.

Bubble: when market participants drive stock prices above their "fair value" in relation to some system of stock valuation.

